Theories of
Entrepreneurship:
Alternative Assumptions
and the Study of
Entrepreneurial Action

Theories of Entrepreneurship: Alternative Assumptions and the Study of Entrepreneurial Action

Sharon A. Alvarez

Fisher College of Business The Ohio State University 2100 Neil Avenue, 850 Columbus Ohio 43210 USA

alvarez_42@cob.osu.edu



the essence of knowledge

Boston - Delft

Foundations and Trends[®] in Entrepreneurship

Published, sold and distributed by: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 1024 Hanover, MA 02339 USA Tel. +1 (781) 871 0245 www.nowpublishers.com sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 179 2600 AD Delft The Netherlands Tel. +31-6-51115274

A Cataloging-in-Publication record is available from the Library of Congress.

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN: 1-933019-11-5; ISSNs: Paper version 1551-3114; Electronic version 1551-3122 © 2005 S.A. Alvarez

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright licence holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands; www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

Contents

Sect	ion 1 Introduction	1	
Sect	ion 2 Theory One: The Discovery Theory. Individual/opportunity nexus view	3	
2.1	Assumption One: Objective opportunities	3	
2.2	.2 Assumption Two: Unique individuals		
2.3	3 Assumption Three: Entrepreneurs are risk-bearing		
2.4	How are these assumptions related?	5	
Sect	ion 3 Theory Two: The Creation Theory	7	
3.1	Assumption One: Subjective opportunities	7	
3.2	Assumption Two: Individuals do not recognize opportunities,		
	they create them	9	
3.3	Assumption Three: Entrepreneurs bear uncertainty	9	
3.4	How are these assumptions related?	12	

${\bf vi} \quad {\it Contents}$

Sec	tion 4	Are these theories contradictory or complementary?	13
Sec	tion 5	Entrepreneurship phenomena	15
5.1	What	is a firm?	15
5.2	Currer	nt theories of the firm	17
5.3	Uncert	cainty and prior theories of the firm	19
5.4	Organ	izing a firm under uncertainty	23
5.5	Introd	ucing market uncertainty into transactions cost	
	econor	nics	24
5.6	Value	creation and market uncertainty	24
5.7	Transa	actions problems under high market uncertainty	25
\mathbf{Sec}_{1}	tion 6	Rents, quasi-rents, and entrepreneurial rents	2 9
6.1	Rents		29
6.2	Govern	nance problems	31
6.3	Who s	hould control decision-making in a firm?	32
Sect	tion 7	The governance effects of behavioral and market uncertainty	35
Section 8		Differences in theoretical predictions	39
Section 9		Discussion	41
Ref	erences		43

1

Introduction

The field of entrepreneurship continues to struggle with the development of a modern theory of entrepreneurship [25]. In the past 20 years development of the current theories of entrepreneurship have centered on either opportunity recognition ([22]; [8]) or the individual entrepreneur ([48]; [11]; [10]). During this same time period many theoretical insights also came from those in other fields such as economics ([32]; [12]) and a rediscovery of the work of Schumpeter ([55], [56]).

However, despite the attempts of many entrepreneurship scholars to develop theory in this field there continues to be a lack of consensus about what constitutes entrepreneurship theory and no generally accepted theory of entrepreneurship has emerged. This lack of consensus is in large part due to the lack of clarity that entrepreneurship scholars have about the unstated assumptions of entrepreneurship. As Gartner [25] suggests, we in the field of entrepreneurship are unaware of the assumptions that we make in our theoretical perspectives.

While different explanations of entrepreneurship have adopted sometimes radically different theoretical assumptions, most of these concern three central features of entrepreneurial phenomena: the nature of entrepreneurial opportunities ([32], [62]; [22]), the nature of entre-

2 Introduction

preneurs as individuals ([48]; [11]; [10]), and the nature of the decision-making context within which entrepreneurs operate ([36]; [4]).

That most efforts to develop theoretically rigorous explanations of entrepreneurship adopt assumptions with respect to these characteristics does not imply that they have adopted the same assumption. Indeed, as is shown here, different theoretical traditions in the field sometimes adopt radically different assumptions with respect to these attributes of entrepreneurial phenomena, and thus develop sometimes radically different explanations of these phenomena.

Unfortunately, with few exceptions [61], most entrepreneurship scholars are not explicit about the assumptions they are using [25]. Moreover, when developing their particular theoretical perspective, many authors tend to adopt the view that the only reasonable assumption that can be made, say, about the nature of opportunities or the nature of entrepreneurs, is the assumption they are making [54]. A failure to be explicit about these critical assumptions, and an unwillingness to entertain alternative assumptions has hampered the development of theory in the field of entrepreneurship [25].

The purpose of this text is to investigate two sets of assumptions about the nature of opportunities, the nature of entrepreneurs, and the nature of the decision-making context within which entrepreneurs operate. It is suggested that these two sets of assumptions constitute two logically consistent theories of entrepreneurship. Moreover, these two theories – far from being contradictory – are complementary in nature, since each applies in very different settings. Finally, these two complementary perspectives are applied to widely studied entrepreneurial phenomena, the organization of the entrepreneurial firm. These applications demonstrate both the differences between these two theories and how they can be complementary in nature.

References

- [1] W. J. Abernathy and J. M. Utterback, "Patterns of industrial innovation," *Technology Review*, pp. 41–47, June/July, 1978.
- [2] A. Alchian and H. Demsetz, "Production information costs and economic organization," *American Economic Review*, vol. 62, pp. 777–795, 1972.
- [3] S. Alvarez and J. Barney, "Organizing rent generation and appropriation: Toward a theory of the entrepreneurial firm," *Journal of Business Venturing*, vol. 19, no. 5, pp. 621–635, 2004.
- [4] S. A. Alvarez and J. B. Barney, "How do entrepreneurs organize under conditions of uncertainty?," *Journal of Management*, vol. Forthcoming, 2005.
- [5] J. Barney, "Strategic factor markets: Expectations, luck and business strategy," Management Science, vol. 42, pp. 1231–1241, 1986.
- [6] J. B. Barney, "Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage," *Journal of Management*, vol. 17, pp. 99–120, 1991.
- [7] J. Barney and M. Hansen, "Trustworthiness as a source of competitive advantage," *Strategic Management Journal*, vol. 15, pp. 175–190, 1994.
- [8] R. A. Baron and T. B. Ward, "Expanding entrepreneurial cognition's toolbox: Potential contributions from the field of cognitive science," *Entrepreneurship: Theory and Practice*, vol. 28, pp. 553, 2004.
- [9] R. Brealey and S. Myers, Principles of Corporate Finance, McGraw-Hill, New York, 1988.
- [10] L. Busenitz and J. Barney, "Differences between entrepreneurs and managers in large organizations: Biases and heuristics in strategic decision-making," *Journal of Business Venturing*, vol. 12, pp. 9–30, 1997.
- [11] O. F. Collins and D. G. Moore, The Enterprising Man, Michigan State University, East Lansing, 1964.

44 References

- [12] M. Casson, The Entrepreneur: An Economic Theory, 2nd ed., Edward Elgar, Martin Robertson, Oxford, 1982.
- [13] R. Coase, "The nature of the firm," *Economica*, vol. 4, pp. 386–405, 1937.
- [14] James S. Coleman, Power and the Structure of Society, Norton, New York, 1974.
- [15] K. Conner and C. Prahalad, "A resource-based theory of the firm: Knowledge versus opportunism," Organization Science, vol. 7, no. 5, pp. 477–501, 1996.
- [16] R. Cyert and M. DeGroot, Bayesian Analysis and Uncertainty in Economic Theory, Rowman & Littlefield, New Jersey, 1987.
- [17] T. E. Deal and A. A. Kenney, Corporate Cultures, Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1982.
- [18] D. Dequech, "Expectations and confidence under uncertainty," Journal of Post Keynesian Economics, vol. 21, no. 3, pp. 415–430, 1999.
- [19] D. Dequech, "Uncertainty and economic sociology: A preliminary discussion," American Journal of Economics and Sociology, vol. 62, no. 3, pp. 509–532, 2003.
- [20] I. Dierickx and K. Cool, "Asset stock accumulation and sustainability of competitive advantage," *Management Science*, vol. 35, pp. 1504, 1989.
- [21] N. Foss, "Knowledge-based approaches to the theory of the firm: Some critical comments," Organization Science, vol. 7, no. 5, pp. 470–476, 1996.
- [22] C. Gaglio and J. Katz, "The psychological basis of opportunity identification: Entrepreneurial alertness," Small Business Economics, vol. 16, pp. 95–111, 2001
- [23] W. B. Gartner, "A conceptual framework for describing the phenomenon of new venture creation," Academy of Management Review, vol. 10, pp. 696, 1985.
- [24] W. Gartner, "Who is the entrepreneur is the wrong question," American Journal of Small Business, vol. 12, pp. 11–32, 1988.
- [25] W. B. Gartner, "Is there an elephant in entrepreneurship? Blind assumptions in theory development," *Entrepreneurship: Theory and Practice*, vol. 25, pp. 27, 2001.
- [26] S. Grossman and O. Hart, "The cost and benefits of ownership: A theory of vertical and lateral integration," *Journal of Political Economy*, vol. 94, pp. 691–719, 1986.
- [27] S. Grossman and O. Hart, "One share one vote and the market for corporate control," *Journal of Financial Economics*, no. 20, pp. 175–202, 1987.
- [28] O. Hart and J. Moore, "Incomplete contracts and renegotiation," *Econometrica*, vol. 56, no. 4, pp. 755–786, 1988.
- [29] O. Hart, Firms, Contacts, and Financial Structure, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1995.
- [30] B. Holmstrom and J. Tirole, "The theory of the firm," In: Handbook of Industrial Organization, Schmalensee, R. and Willig, R., North-Holland, Amsterdam, pp. 61–133, 1989.
- [31] Jensen, M. C. and Meckling, W. H., Theory of the Firm: Managerial Behavior, Agency Costs and Ownership Structure, Elsevier Science Publishing Company, Inc., vol. 3, 1976.
- [32] I. Kirzner, Perception, Opportunity, and Profit, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1979.

- [33] I. M. Kirzner, "Entrepreneurial discovery and the competitive market process: An austrian approach," *Journal of Economic Literature*, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 60–85, 1997.
- [34] B. Klein, R. Crawford, and A. Alchian, "Vertical integration, appropriable rents, and the competitive contracting process," *Journal of Law & Economics*, vol. 21, no. 2, pp. 297–327, 1978.
- [35] I. Kirzner, Competition and Entrepeneurship, University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 1973.
- [36] R. Knight, "Cost of production and price over long and short periods," *Journal of Political Economy*, vol. 29, pp. 332, 1921.
- [37] R. N. Langlois and M. M. Cosgel, "Frank Knight on risk, uncertainty, and the firm: A new interpretation," *Economic Inquiry*, vol. 31, no. 3, pp. 456–466, 1993.
- [38] B. Loasby, "The organizational basis of cognition and the cognitive basis of organization," In: The Economics of Choice, Change and Organization, Essays in Memory of Richard M. Cyert, Augier, M. and March, J. G., Edward Elgar, Cheltenham, UK, 2002.
- [39] J. Mahoney, "The choice of organizational form: Vertical financial ownership versus other methods of vertical integration," *Strategic Management Journal*, vol. 13, pp. 559–584, 1992.
- [40] J. Mahoney, "A resource-based view of sustainable rents," Journal of Management, vol. 27, no. 6, pp. 651–660, 2001.
- [41] J. Mahoney and S. Michael, "A subjectivist theory of entrepreneurship," In: Handbook of Entrepreneurship Research: Disciplinary Perspectives, Alvarez, S. A., Ararwal, R., and Sorenson, O., Springer, New York, 2005.
- [42] A. Madhok, "Reassessing the fundamentals and beyond: Ronald Coase, the transaction cost and resource-based theories of the firm and the institutional structure of production," *Strategic Management Journal*, vol. 23, no. 6, pp. 535–550, 2002.
- [43] A. Marshall, Principles of Economics. 8th ed., MacMillan, London, 1930.
- [44] E. Maskin and J. Tirole, "Unforeseen contingencies and incomplete contracts," *Review of Economic Studies*, vol. 66, no. 226, pp. 83–115, 1999.
- [45] E. Maskin and J. Tirole, "Two remarks on the property-rights literature," *Review of Economic Studies*, vol. 66, no. 226, pp. 139–150, 1999.
- [46] R. K. Merton, Social Theory and Social Structure, Free Press, New York, 1957.
- [47] Ludwig von Mises, Human Action, Yale University Press, New Haven, 1949.
- [48] D. McClelland, The Achieving Society, Van Nostrand, Princeton JH, 1961.
- [49] W. Ouchi, "Markets, bureaucracies, and clans," Administrative Science Quarterly, vol. 25, pp. 121–141, 1980.
- [50] M. Peteraf and J. Barney, "Unraveling the resource-based tangle," Managerial and Decision Economics, vol. 24, no. 4, pp. 309–320, 2003.
- [51] M. E. Porter, Competitive Strategy, The Free Press, New York, 1980.
- [52] M. Riordan and O. Williamson, "Asset specificity and economic organization," International Journal of Industrial Organization, vol. 3, pp. 365–378, 1985.
- [53] R. P. Rumelt, "Theory, strategy, and entrepreneurship," In: The Competitive Challenge: Strategies for Industrial Innovation and Renewal, Teece, D. J., Ballinger Publishing Company, Cambridge, MA, pp. 137–158, 1987.

46 References

- [54] S. Sarasvathy, "Causation and effectuation: Toward a theoretical shift from economic inevitability to entrepreneurial contingency," *Academy of Management Review*, vol. 26, pp. 243–263, 2001.
- [55] J. Schumpeter, Theory of Economic Development: An Inquiry into Profits, Capital, Credit, Interest and the Business Cycle, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1934.
- [56] J. A. Schumpeter, Business Celes. A Theoretical, Historical, and Statistical Analysis of the Capitalist Process, McGraw-Hill, New York and London, 1939.
- [57] A. Saxenian, Regional Advantage: Culture and Competition in Silicon Valley and Route 128, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1996 (March).
- [58] Shackle, Expectation in Economics, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1949.
- [59] G. L. S. Shackle, Epistemics and Economics, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1972.
- [60] G. L. S. Shackle, Imagination and the Nature of Choice, Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, 1979.
- [61] S. Shane, A General Theory of Entrepreneurship. The Individual-Opportunity Nexus, Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc., Massachusetts, 2003.
- [62] S. Shane and S. Venkataraman, "The promise of entrepreneurship as a field of research," Academy of Management Review, vol. 25, no. 1, pp. 217–226, 2000.
- [63] H. Simon, Administrative Behavior: A study of Decision-Making Processes in Administrative Organizations. 1st, 2nd, 3rd, and 4th ed., Free Press, New York, 1947, 1957a, 1961, 1976, 1997.
- [64] J. D. Thompson, Organization in Action, McGraw-Hill, New York, 1967.
- [65] M. Triola, Elementary Statistics. 9th ed., Addison Wesley, Boston, 2003.
- [66] S. Venkataraman, "Preface," In: A General Theory of Entrepreneurship. The Individual-Opportunity Nexus, Shane, S., Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc., Massachusetts, 2003.
- [67] A. Wald, Statistical Decision Functions, John Wiley, New York, 1950.
- [68] G. Walker and D. Weber, "A transaction cost approach to make or buy decisions," Administrative Science Quarterly, vol. 29, pp. 373–91, 1984.
- [69] M. Weber, "The Methodology of the Social Sciences," Shils, Edward and Finch, Henry, Free Press, New York, 1903.
- [70] O. E. Williamson, Markets and Hierarchies: Analysis and Antitrust Implications, Free Press, New York, 1975.
- [71] O. E. Williamson, The Economic Institutions of Capitalism, Free Press, New York, 1985.
- [72] O. E. Williamson, "Transforming merger policy: The pound of new perspectives," American Economic Review, vol. 76, pp. 114, 1986.
- [73] O. E. Williamson, "Strategizing, economizing, and economic organization," Strategic Management Journal, vol. 12, pp. 75–94, 1991.
- [74] O. E. Williamson and S. E. Masten, The Economics of Transaction Costs, Elgar, Northampton, MA, 1999.